

Securing Our Protectors:

The Case for Improving Standards in Philadelphia's Security Industry





Philadelphia security officers represented by SEIU Local 32BJ rallying for a better contract in 2016

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	4
Introduction	5
I – Contracted security officers keep Philadelphia's critica industries running safely	
Who are Philadelphia's Security Officers?	
Security officers protect critical industries	
Private guards regularly respond to many different security incidents	7
II – Unregulated industry standards undermine the potential for improved security, safety, and service	
Security officers report additional critical training is needed	
High turnover drives out experienced security officers	9
Low industry wages are causing severe economic hardship, likel impacting performance	
III – Security work should be a path to expand Philadelph Black middle class	nia's 11
Uplifting security officers will in turn benefit the families and communities that officers support	11
IV – Philadelphia can take concrete action to support officers and improve security outcomes	12
Wealthy employers and clients can afford to do right by these critical workers	13
V – Security officers made Philadelphia's recovery possib they deserve to share in it	
Endnotes	

- Every day, private security officers put their lives on the line to protect Philadelphia's critical industries and infrastructure. Philadelphia's 14,000 private security guards protect hospitals, universities, airports, ports, commercial office buildings, cultural venues, stadiums, and many other buildings. Officers regularly resolve security incidents, some of which are quite high-risk: half of security officers say that they have encountered dangerous situations within the last year, such as active confrontations.¹
- Unfortunately, the city's security guards are struggling with wages below the cost-of-living and non-standardized training practices, undermining the potential for improved security and service. Many security officers are in financial crisis: struggling with food, housing, and medical insecurity. This directly impacts their performance on the job and drives high turnover: the median security officer only has nine months of experience on the job. Many security officers report inconsistent training on key subjects, potentially leaving some officers "without the necessary skills to ensure the safety of themselves or the public."²
- Security guards are Philadelphia's Black working class. They deserve a path to enter Philadelphia's middle class. The vast majority of Philadelphia security officers – six-in-seven – identify as Black or African-American.³ Of these Black officers, over 90% lack a college degree.⁴ Most are working to provide for their family, including children and dependents. If we can raise industry standards, these guards will uplift their families and communities along with them.
- We call upon the city of Philadelphia, security employers, and clients to collaborate with security guards to raise standards through legislation and voluntary action. The city council can take immediate action by mandating employers provide standard training to unarmed guards, addressing a gap in state policy for this critical industry. The council can also raise standards by expanding paid sick leave to cover unionized guards. While a statutory wage standard is pre-empted by the state, employers and clients should voluntarily invest in public safety by raising security officers' wages.



Debbie Chestnut Security officer working at Temple Hospital

I have worked as a security officer at Temple Hospital for 2 years. I work in two of the most difficult and dangerous areas of the hospital: the mental health unit and the emergency department.

Recently, while on duty in the emergency department, I was attempting to calm a woman down when she became violent and threw a chair at me, causing severe injury to my hand and wrist. I was forced to miss work and pay a \$100 copay to the hospital for an injury sustained while on duty. On the mental health unit floor, we had a man with Alzheimer's who was 6'6 and would get violent with us. My five-foot self and other guards would have to try and restrain him while getting kicked, spit on, and bitten. Daily, I'm responsible for handling patients struggling with substance abuse disorders, people experiencing homelessness, angry and upset family members, and confused patients.

I wish there was more training – it would help people understand what they're walking into with a job like this. You can't prepare for everything, but you can prepare for some things.



Introduction

Every day, Philadelphia's security guards put their lives on the line to protection the critical institutions that make the city run.

Philadelphia relies heavily on these guards to protect its universities, hospitals, office buildings, airports, museums, and many other sectors. They are an integral – if often overlooked – component of the city's public safety ecosystem. For example, although Philadelphia is home to a number of large and prestigious universities, these campuses sometimes must cope with criminal conduct, including acts of violence.⁵ Many of the City's premiere institutions of higher learning rely heavily on privately contracted security officers to supplement their campus police forces.

While Philadelphia has made significant strides over recent years in reducing rates of violent crime, there is still meaningful progress to be made. This report considers the important role privately contracted security guards have to play in improving public safety for all Philadelphians, the challenges those guards face both on and off the job, and the role officers play supporting their families and communities. At the end, we propose a number of concrete recommendations including raising wages, establishing training requirements for unarmed guards, and expanding the city's paid sick leave law.

Many of the claims discussed in this report are drawn from a survey conducted by Service Employees International Union Local 32BJ of union members employed by Allied Universal, Colonial, GardaWorld, Harvard Protection, and Securitas, among other companies. The survey was conducted from April through May 2025 and received 552 responses.

I Contracted security officers keep Philadelphia's critical industries running safely

Who are Philadelphia's Security Officers?

Security officers play an important role in Philadelphia's public safety ecosystem, augmenting the work of police by guarding geographically specific buildings and institutions. These are demanding jobs: like police, security officers cannot anticipate threats ahead of time. Many of the sites they protect are in dangerous parts of the city and face a high frequency of incidents. When an incident does occur at these protected locations, guards are frequently the first personnel to respond due to their proximity.

As of 2023, the U.S. Census Bureau estimates there are 14,000 security officers working in Philadelphia.⁶ While many of these officers are in-house – employed directly by the institutions they protect – a large majority are privately contracted.⁷ This means they are employed by firms specializing in security services who contract out their services to independent clients.

Security officers protect critical industries

Philadelphia's economy depends on private security, as the top sectors contract heavily from security firms. Some are those driving Philly's current job growth, such as education, healthcare, and biotechnology.⁸ Others – while mature – make significant contributions to the region's economy. For example, major transportation and commercial infrastructure such as the Philadelphia International Airport, Northeast Philadelphia Airport, and the Port of Philadelphia collectively generate over \$18 billion in local economic impact while supporting 100,000 local jobs.⁹ Many of these sectors have physical infrastructure located in historically under-resourced parts of the city, which today contend with higher rates of violence and public health crises that threaten to undermine their stability and drive out investments/businesses. To ensure their safe and continued operation – especially at high-incident sites - these institutions rely on the security provided by contracted private guards.



Stephanie Gibson Security officer working at a commercial office building in Center City

I am a proud mother of six children. That includes a recent college graduate, two in college, and two in high school. Their accomplishments drive me to be the best mom I can be every day despite the hardships I face.

Let's talk about groceries. Making \$16.25 an hour, I take home about \$500 weekly after taxes. I go shopping every two weeks and spend \$350 on groceries, which is enough for the bare essentials on a good trip. I was evicted because I didn't make enough for my own home. We now live with my mother, and I help her out with her mortgage and the electric and phone bills for myself and all my kids. Right now, I'm living in survival mode.

I was supposed to go to college myself in September but we just don't have the money. Instead, I applied for a second security job overnight. That would mean working my current shift from 3 pm to 11 pm and work a second shift from 11 pm to 7 am the next day. Many of **Philadelphia's major institutions** rely on **privately contracted security**, indirectly employing thousands of officers. Imagine Philadelphia's economy if these institutions were not able to operate:

- •University of Pennsylvania
- Penn Medicine
- Temple University
- •Temple Health
- Thomas Jefferson University
- Drexel University
- •Philadelphia Navy Yard
- Schuylkill Yards
- Comcast Building
- Aramark Building
- BNY Mellon Center
- Terminal Commerce Building

Private guards regularly respond to many different security incidents

Security officers regularly respond to potential dangers: in a survey, three-in-five officers say they encounter at least one security incident in a week and one-in-five said they encounter three-or-more security incidents each week.¹⁰ Security incidents vary significantly: they can range from redirecting mentally unwell individuals outside of building lobbies in Center City to responding to drunk and disorderly behavior at the University of Pennsylvania or searching for drugs and weapons on incoming patients at Episcopalian Hospital, patients who may be noncooperative or outright resistant.

Many of these incidents can involve serious crises. Half of security officers say they have encountered high-risk incidents within the last year, such as individuals requiring emergency medical assistance, individuals in severe emotional or mental distress, or active confrontations with agitated individuals.¹¹ Some officers also report encountering violent threats, such as drug trafficking, knife violence, gun violence, and suicide attempts.¹² Hospitals in particular can be high-intensity worksites for security officers due to the frequency with which these institutions respond to individuals in crisis or encountering violence.



Jordan Drayton Security officer working at Temple University

I am as security officer at the Liacouras Center parking lot at Temple University. The craziest incident I've ever experienced on the job is when someone walking through the garage tried to steal a student's car. They got to a car where the student had left his keys in it and drove through the exit arms where you have to pay or tap your permit.

As they were trying to make their grand theft auto escape, they drove through the parking services office, crashing right where the managers desk is. Luckily, he was walking to the printer and not at his desk.

We didn't think it was a theft as he approached because the key was in the

ignition, and he didn't speed up until he got to the gate. We helped him out of the car because he was out cold from the air bags deploying and the impact. Once he came to, he tried to run away but he was hurt and fell.

We called Temple police, and the cops showed up, but we were the first responders. We saw the chaos unfold and handled the immediate aftermath. We helped the car robber get out of the car and stayed with him until emergency services arrived.

I'd love to get more training on de-escalation and emergency medical response so that the next time something like this happens, we can do more.

II Unregulated industry standards undermine the potential for improved security, safety, and service

Security officers report additional critical training is needed

Currently, Philadelphia has no legal standard mandating that employers provide security officer training. Pennsylvania is one of the few states that does not require training for unarmed guards.¹³ In the absence of such a standard, officers report that what training they are provided is inconsistent or absent. For example, more than one-in-three security officers say that they have either never received training from their employer on how to safely de-escalate a hostile confrontation or have not received a refresher within the last year.¹⁴

Extrapolating these survey results to the city as a whole suggests that thousands of privately contracted Philadelphia security officers lack this foundational training.

While de-escalation training is inconsistent, training on basic emergency response is often altogether absent. Less than half of security officers





Tyrone Patterson Security officer working at a commercial office building in Center City

I have been a member of the union for 20 years, serving as a security officer in Center City.

I'm what the young folks call an OG, and in my 20 years holding down my building, I've just about seen it all, including people destroying property, aggressively trying to enter the building, and not liking it when we say they can't come in. We need conflict resolution training because we are surrounded by chaos, and it does try to come in.

Security Officers need an incredible level of patience and I think training could help with that. We deal with rude people coming in and out of the building all the time. Training could make a big difference preparing new officers on how to handle that constructively. report they have been taught how to administer CPR.¹⁵ The overwhelming majority of officers state they have never been trained on emergency medical techniques such as how to apply a tourniquet, respond to a gunshot or knife wound, handle a suicide attempt, or respond to a respiratory or cardiac emergency.¹⁶

The security industry's lack of minimum training standards is especially concerning given the frequency with which officers report encountering aggressive confrontations or medical emergencies – about 30% of officers for each type of incident.¹⁷ Security officers often act as first responders to incidents that occur within or adjacent to their worksite. Providing these officers with basic medical training could make a critical impact in situations where they are the first to respond to a medical emergency.

Existing research suggests there is a strong relationship between training and security officer performance. Academics at the University of Chicago have found that certain types of police training significantly improve safety outcomes;¹⁸ there is longstanding academic literature which finds that training in general improves performance by enhancing job satisfaction.¹⁹ Research specific to the security industry has argued that insufficient training requirements create a "potentially dangerous situation" where officers are left "without the necessary skills to ensure the safety of themselves or the public."²⁰

High turnover drives out experienced security officers

Every year in Philadelphia, thousands of privately contracted security officers leave their positions. Nationally, turnover in the security industry is extremely high: a 2012 dissertation found that it can range from 100% to 300% a year.²¹ Many Philadelphia security guards lack significant tenure: as of May 2025, the median privately contracted security officer in Philadelphia has just over nine months of experience in their current position.²² One-in-three Philadelphia officers has less than six months of on-the-job experience.²³

Research finds that high turnover can negatively impact public safety. Airports form a particularly instructive case study, given their need for maximal security. In a study on security screeners at airports, researchers found that every 1% increase in screener turnover was associated with a 0.62% decrease in security breach detections, meaning that as turnover increased security breaches also went up.²⁴ Researchers have also found that a stable workforce is better at detecting threats,²⁵ makes fewer errors,²⁶ and is better prepared for emergencies.²⁷

These findings are commonsense: workers who can securely access housing, healthcare, and food are less likely to look for a better deal elsewhere.

The most effective method for reducing turnover is raising job standards, specifically wages:²⁸ there is now a long-standing body of research that establishes a strong link between compensation and job



Parisha Blount Security officer working at an office building in Center City

I would like to see more training. I've experienced some crazy scenarios: fire drills, elevator entrapments, unruly people trying to get past the front desk, the parking elevator going out, etc. I also want more medical training to be able to help people. We are first responders and I want to be able to help when the situation arises. tenure.²⁹ A study on the effect of San Francisco's 2003 minimum wage increase saw significant decrease in turnover in low-wage industries.³⁰ In another study researchers found that every 1% increase in wages resulted in a 1.45% decrease in turnover.³¹ The turnover effects of wage increases are so substantial that they offset the costs of the increase: one study on multiple minimum wage increases found savings through turnover reduced overall costs attached to the increase by 20%.³²

Low industry wages are causing severe economic hardship, likely impacting performance

Financial insecurity not only drives turnover: it may also impact workers' performance on the job itself. The unfortunate reality for most Philadelphia security officers is that, although the work they perform is critical to the city, low wages across the industry expose many to deep economic precarity. Currently, the median wage for privately contracted security officers in Philadelphia is \$17 an hour according to available data, equivalent to \$35,000 annually for a full-time worker.³³ This is **less than half** of the necessary income for a 1 adult, 1 child household to afford the cost of living in Philadelphia – covering essentials such as food, housing, childcare, and transportation.³⁴

Unsurprisingly, security officers report widespread and significant hardship in their daily lives. Over the past year:

- More than half of officers report having skipped meals or cut back on groceries.³⁵
- Two-in-five report paying their rent or mortgage late or being unable to pay at all.³⁶
- More than one-in-four have delayed or gone without necessary medical care.³⁷

These stressors detract from security officers' ability to respond to threatening situations while at work, no matter any individual officer's best intentions. Anyone who is in crisis at home – whether they are hungry, actively unhoused, or skipping basic medical care – is less likely to be capable of giving 100% on the job, especially when compared against someone else paid a wage sufficient to meet their basic needs.

Financial insecurity not only drives turnover: it may also impact workers' performance on the job itself.



Nitiesha Oglesby Security officer working at the University of Pennsylvania

I am a security officer at UPenn. I have been a member of 32BJ for 11 years.

Recently, my ex-boyfriend moved out. We had been living together but he stopped paying for his share of the rent and electricity. As a result, I ended up owing thousands of dollars in back rent and unpaid electricity bills.

I tried to make a deal with my landlord but I couldn't make the numbers work - it was impossible to pay \$1,500 a month in current and back rent when I was making just under \$2,000 a month.

Sometimes when I didn't get 40 hours, I would end up paying 80% of my paycheck in rent. I couldn't go grocery shopping so often times there was nothing in my refrigerator. I'd worry about simple things like toilet paper or dish detergent running out. I didn't want my electricity turned off, so I fell behind on rent again. I was evicted the day before my birthday. Because I didn't have a place to live, I had to give my cat up to a shelter.

I'm still responsible for the balance on the electric bill and back rent I owe, which means I'll need a few thousand dollars just to get my own apartment again.

I'm grateful for every day God wakes me up and I love to smile and laugh, but it's hard to stay positive with wages that aren't enough for me to get back on my feet. My life is a constant reminder of what I can't do because of the money I don't have.

III Security work should be a path to expand Philadelphia's Black middle class

Uplifting security officers will in turn benefit the families and communities that officers support.

The vast majority of Philadelphia security officers – six-in-seven – identify as Black or African-American.³⁸ Of these Black officers, over 90% lack a college degree.³⁹ By investing in security, the city can not only improve safety outcomes but transform the industry into a pathway for working Philadelphians to join the city's middle class.

Indeed, the vast majority of officers are working to support their families:

- Six-in-seven say they are one of the primary earners for their household.⁴⁰
- Two-in-three are responsible for supporting dependents, on average 2.1.⁴¹
- More than two-in-three are over the age of 30.42

Furthermore, Philadelphia security officers live in communities that direly need investment. A majority of privately contracted security officers live in just ten ZIP codes across Philadelphia. Across these zip codes:

- The poverty rate is significantly higher than Philadelphia as a whole – 31% in these ten ZIP codes versus 20% citywide.⁴³
- There are 43,000 children living in poverty. Although less than a third of Philadelphia residents live in these ten ZIP codes, they contain a majority of all children living in poverty.⁴⁴
- There is a concentration of Black or African-American residents. Half of all Black Philadelphians live in these ten ZIP codes.⁴⁵

These communities need good middle class jobs, especially for Philadelphians who lack a college degree. Two-thirds of Black Philadelphians live in a household that makes less than \$70,000 a year, meaning their household earns less than the living wage for a one-parent, one-child household to afford basic necessities in Philadelphia.⁴⁶ Raising wages for security officers – who will then spend locally – will also drive growth for these communities.



Darayal Brooks Security officer working at Temple University

I work at Temple University where I am a traffic controller. I work in Strawberry Mansion – that's also the neighborhood where I grew up.

I've only been here for a year and a half, but I've already seen a lot: helping a student suffering from a seizure, calming down female athletes who had gotten into a heated argument, even helping to rescue a kitten from a vent.

People tell me I have a calming demeanor. When I'm directing traffic, my signature move is that I make a heart shape. I like to start out these short little interactions with the public in a positive way. We deal with SEPTA busses, construction, students, police, the general public – they all rely on me to help them get where they're going. I love getting to help them. I have what I like to call a rich man's family through my two kids: a teenage daughter and son. We're not wealthy but the love I get from them is invaluable. I want to give my kids the future they deserve. When I was growing up in the 1980s, we would always talk about the importance of morals and family. We need to go back to those values and give everyone a fair chance in life.

I'm a hype man. I truly believe that we can send our kids out into a world that is Heaven on Earth. I don't just want that for my kids: I believe that my colleagues and everyone in Philadelphia deserves it too. The only way that happens is if we spread the wealth out – a lot more than we're doing right now. We can't grow if we don't take care of each other.

IV Philadelphia can take concrete action to support officers and improve security outcomes



These structural problems plaguing Philadelphia's security industry are not insurmountable: there are clear solutions that stand to improve security outcomes and guarantee officers the dignified standard of living they deserve.

We call upon Philadelphia's elected officials and private security employers to:

- Raise security officer wages. More than any other single proposal, boosting security officer wages will help to stabilize and professionalize the industry, improving security outcomes. Unfortunately, the city of Philadelphia is prevented from taking direct action to establish a private wage standard by state law which pre-empts local minimum wage action. In the absence of public policy, we call upon security employers and clients to voluntarily collaborate towards implementing this critical step, and for elected officials to publicly support such efforts.
- Establish a comprehensive citywide training standard. A majority of U.S. states now mandate training for unarmed security officers; Pennsylvania is one of the few that has failed to establish such a standard.⁴⁷ By passing legislation requiring comprehensive in-person initial training and annual refreshers, Philadelphia can empower security officers to better protect both themselves and the public. To be effective, training should be provided at no cost to the employee and should be delivered by a City-certified provider.
- Expand paid sick leave. Currently, Philadelphia's paid sick leave law exempts the thousands of security officers covered by a collective bargaining agreement. Union security officers deserve the same guarantee of paid sick leave that non-union officers currently receive. Philadelphia should amend the law to remove this exemption.



Wealthy employers and clients can afford to do right by these critical workers

Philadelphia security contractors and clients can afford to pay for improved labor standards. Nationally, the security industry earns \$4 billion in profit off \$46 billion in revenue.⁴⁸ The largest company is Allied Universal Security Services, which holds 26% of the market share⁴⁹ and has a significantly higher margin, earning over \$1.5 billion in profit on \$12 billion in annual revenue.⁵⁰ Allied Universal is headquartered in Conshohocken, PA and dominates the Philadelphia metropolitan area market. Similarly, many of the major clients who hire out contracted security officers can afford to share the cost of raising standards. Collectively, Temple University and the University of Pennsylvania – including both of their respective medical systems – made just under \$1.5 billion in profit and over \$20 billion in revenue for FY 2024.⁵¹ Against the backdrop of these large institutional budgets, the cost to fund higher wages and universal training standards is less than a rounding error – excellent "bang for your buck" on investments that may be reasonably expected to improve public safety outcomes.



James Hines Security officer working at Temple University

I've been working as a security officer for five years. Right now, I'm at Temple University. It's calm during the day there, but after dark, crowds of rowdy young kids from nearby neighborhoods hang out at 13th and Montgomery near my post.

The Temple students are seen as easy targets and the kids badger and harass them. Sometimes they even run into dorms behind students as they enter. I have to be hyper-aware at all times. Sometimes it gets wild, even in the day. At lunchtime, campus gates are often locked and I have to walk a dangerous route on side streets.

Having more support in the form of higher wages and more training would make a big difference. It would help bring some stability to the industry.

V Security officers made Philadelphia's recovery possible: they deserve to share in it

Philadelphia is a comeback city. After decades of population flight, capital disinvestment, and high crime, the city is growing again. Private security guards are a critical element in this recovery – putting their bodies on the line to guarantee the safety necessary for leading institutions like Episcopal Hospital and the University of Pennsylvania to operate. Unfortunately, these officers – six in seven of whom are Black⁵² – are falling behind in the city's progress. They suffer from deep financial insecurity and unregulated training that should be addressed to improve security for themselves and the public. The security industry is at a crossroads: Philadelphia can choose to invest in these officers by providing adequate wages, training, and staffing – in the process transforming the industry into a pathway towards the city's growing middle class. Or Philadelphia can do nothing, boxing these guardians out of any means to access the city's growing prosperity while passing up the opportunity to improve trainings and the safety of officers and the public. We call upon elected officials, security employers, and industry clients to embrace the former option, for the collective benefit of Philadelphia as a whole.



- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025. Question 3: "Summary" tab, cell 122
- 2 Michael S. Klein, Leah Ruiz, and Craig Hemmens. A Statutory Analysis of State Regulation of Security Guard Training Requirements. Published in the Criminal Justice Policy Review, 2016. Please see pdf page 16, specifically the final sentence of the conclusion.
- 3 Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race by Schooling," cell A15.
- 4 Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race by Schooling," cell W25.
- 5 Diane Mastrull. Temple University student arrested in off-campus stabbing in North Philadelphia. Published in the Philly Inquirer, February 9, 2025. <u>https://www.inquirer.</u> <u>com/crime/temple-student-arrested-stabbing-philadelphia-20250209.html</u>

Michaela Althouse. Temple University police arrest 7 people tied to weekend assaults on campus. Published in the Philly Voice, April 21, 2025. <u>https://www.phillyvoice.com/tem-</u> ple-university-assaults-on-campus-arrests/

- 6 Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race by Schooling," cell C11.
- U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. Occupation Employment and Wages, May 2023 – 33-9032 Security Guards. Accessed on May 23, 2025, last modified April 3, 2024. <u>https://www.bls.gov/oes/2023/may/oes339032.htm#ind</u>

The first table under the section entitled "Industry Profile for Security Guards" shows that 73.69% of security guards are employed in the "Investigation and Security Services" industry, which we interpret to refer to private security contractors.

- 8 Newmark. Greater Philadelphia Office Market Overview 1Q25. Published on April 21, 2025. <u>https://nmrk.imgix.net/uploads/fields/pdf-market-reports/1Q25-Greater-Philadel-phia-Office-Market-Report_2025-04-21-181458_pmsy.pdf</u> Please see slide 6, which shows "Employment Growthy by Industry, 12-Month% Change, February 2025." Education and Health is the sector responsible for the second-most job growth.
- 9 PHL. Study Shows \$18.7 billion impact of PHL and PNE. Accessed on May 23, 2025, published December 17, 2025. https://www.phl.org/newsroom/Regional-Economic-Impact

- 10 Bargaining Survey Q4
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025. Question 3: "Summary" tab, cell 122
- 12 Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025.

Question 3: "Summary" tab, cells E21:G23

13 National Association of Security Companies. WHITE PAPER: Security Officer Training Requirements. Published June 2021. https://www.nasco.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/ NASCO-White-Paper-on-State-Security-Officer-Training-Hour-Requirements-06-21-1.pdf

See pdf page 3: second-last-sentence of the second paragraph entitled unarmed training plus footnote 2.

- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025.
 Question 7: "Summary" tab, cell I48
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025. Question 8: "Summary" tab, cell G54
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025.
 Question 8: "Summary" tab, cells E55:G60
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025.
 Question 3: "Summary" tab, cells E24:G26
- 18 Oeindrila Dube, Sandy Jo MacArthur, and Anuj K. Shah. A Cognitive View of Policing. Bekcer Friedman Institute for Economics at UChicago, Working paper No. 2023-118. Published September 2023. <u>http://odube.net/wp-content/uploads/2024/06/A-Cognitive-View-of-Policing.pdf</u>

See pdf page 6. Dube et al find that their cognitive training method "reduces uses of non-lethal force by 23%."

19 Patrick L. Owens, Jr. One more reason not to cut your training budget: the relationship between training and organizational outcomes. Published in the Journal of Public Personnel Management, Volume 35 No. 2, Summer 2006. Please see the second sentence at the top of pdf page 7, which states: The results support the notion that training affects job satisfaction, organizational commitment and turnover cognitions, all of which are tied to organizational success."

- **20** Michael S. Klein, Leah Ruiz, and Craig Hemmens. A Statutory Analysis of State Regulation of Security Guard Training Requirements. Published in the Criminal Justice Policy Review, 2016. Please see pdf page 16, specifically the final sentence of the conclusion.
- 21 Lozano Gerardo de los Santos. An exploratory study of contracted security officers' retention. Published 2012 in the Pepperdine University Digital Commons. <u>https://digitalcommons.pepperdine.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1238&context=etd</u>

Please see the first sentence of the third paragraph of pdf page 18.

- **22** Analysis of 32BJ Membership Data for Security Officers represented under the Philadelphia Security Master Agreement. Data pulled May 15, 2025. Please see the excel spread-sheet entitled "PhillySecurityChurn 5-15-25", tab "All Jobs History", cell H3.
- 23 Analysis of 32BJ Membership Data for Security Officers represented under the Philadelphia Security Master Agreement. Data pulled May 15, 2025. Please see the excel spreadsheet entitled "PhillySecurityChurn 5-15-25", tab "All Jobs History", cell E1.
- 24 Gallear, Amanda. "The Impact of Wages and Turnover on Security and Safety in Airport." UC Berkeley Labor Center. October 18, 2017. <u>https://laborcenter.berkeley.edu/pdf/2017/</u> SFO-literature-review.pdf page 4.

Reich, Michael, Peter Hall, and Ken Jacobs. 2003. Living Wages and Economic Performance: The San Francisco Airport Model. Institute of Industrial Relations, University of California, Berkeley. <u>http://laborcenter.berkeley.edu/</u> <u>living-wages-and-economic-performance-the-san-francisco-airport-model/</u>

25 Reich, Michael, Peter Hall, and Ken Jacobs. 2003. Living Wages and Economic Performance: The San Francisco Airport Model. Institute of Industrial Relations, University of California, Berkeley. <u>https://laborcenter.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/Living-Wages-and-Economic-Per-</u> formance-The-San-Francisco-Airport-Model.pdf

See page 77, section 7.2, paragraph 4 (after the linear regression equation)

26 Gallear, Amanda. "The Impact of Wages and Turnover on Security and Safety in Airport." UC Berkeley Labor Center. October 18, 2017. https://laborcenter.berkeley.edu/pdf/2017/ SFO-literature-review.pdf

See page 5, paragraph 3, "Skorupski and Uchroński (2015)..."

 27 "September 27, 2018 Board Minutes." Board Minutes and Contract Authorizations. Port Authority NY NJ. September 2018. <u>https://www.panynj.gov/corporate/en/board-meet-</u> ing-info/board-minutes-contract-authorizations.html PDF page 69-74, Section 2 "Reduced turnover will improve training," Section 3 "Reduced turnover will improve vetting," and Section 4 "Reduced turnover will reduce the risk of accidents".

28 "We now know minimum wage increases have well-identified causal impacts that reduce worker turnover."

Reich, Michael, Sylvia A. Allegretto, Ken Jacobs, and Claire Montialoux. 2016. "The Effects of a \$15 Minimum Wage in New York State." Center on Wage and Employment Dynamics, Institute for Research on Labor and Employment, UC Berkeley, Berkeley, CA. <u>https://irle.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/The-Effects-of-a-15-Minimum-Wage-in-New-York-State.pdf top of page 24</u>

See also Gallear, Amanda. "The Impact of Wages and Turnover on Security and Safety in Airport." UC Berkeley Labor Center. October 18, 2017. https://laborcenter.berkeley.edu/ pdf/2017/SFO-literature-review.pdf

See also Cotton, John L., and Jeffrey M. Tuttle. 1986. "Employee Turnover: A Meta-Analysis and Review with Implications for Future Research." The Academy of Management Review 11 (1): 55–70. http://www.jstor.org/ stable/258331

Dube, Arindrajit, Suresh Naidu, and Michael Reich. 2007. "The Economic Effects of a Citywide Minimum Wage." Industrial and Labor Relations Review 60 (4): 522–43. <u>http://</u> <u>www.jstor.org/stable/25249108</u> Dube, Arindrajit, T. William Lester, and Michael Reich. 2016. "Minimum Wage Shocks, Employment Flows and Labor Market Friction." Journal of Labor Economics 34 (3): 663-704.

Above sources summarized by Gallear: Cotton and Tuttle (1986) performed a meta-analysis of turnover studies, finding that higher pay and lower turnover are significantly correlated. Dube, Naidu, and Reich (2007) find that after San Francisco raised the minimum wage by 26 percent in 2003, the restaurant industry saw decreased turnover and an increase in worker tenure. Dube, Lester, and Reich (2016) use national data and find that for a 10 percent increase in the minimum wage, turnover rates decline 2.2 percent for teens and 2.1 percent for restaurant workers.

- 29 "It also appears that pay is a reliable correlate with turnover." Cotton, John L., and Jeffrey M. Tuttle. 1986. "Employee Turnover: A Meta-Analysis and Review with Implications for Future Research." The Academy of Management Review 11 (1): 55–70. <u>https://www.researchgate.net/publication/211384381_Employee_Turnover_A_Meta-Analysis_and_Review_With_Implications_for_Research page 65 (middle paragraph left column)</u>
- Dube, Arindrajit, Suresh Naidu, and Michael Reich. 2007.
 "The Economic Effects of a Citywide Minimum Wage." Industrial and Labor Relations Review 60 (4): 522–43. <u>http://</u> www.jstor.org/stable/25249108

Fast-food and table-service restaurants responded differently to the policy, with a small price increase and substantial increases in job tenure and in the proportion of full-time workers among fast-food restaurants, but not among table-service restaurants.

- **31** Jacobs, Ken and Dave Graham-Squire. 2010. "Labor Standards for School Cafeteria Workers, Turnover and Public Program Utilization." Berkeley Journal of Employment and Labor Law, 31(2): 447-459. <u>http://scholarship.law.berkeley.</u> edu/bjell/vol31/iss2/6
- **32** "Based on these results, we assume that the minimum wage increases to \$10.50 and \$15 per hour, respectively, will generate reductions in worker turnover that will offset 20 percent of the overall wage bill increase."

Pollin, Robert and Jeannette Wicks-Lim. 2015. "A \$15 U.S. Minimum Wage: How the Fast-Food Industry Could Adjust Without Shedding Jobs." Political Economy Research Institute, University of Massachusetts Amherst, Working Paper 373. https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/26606422.pdf?casa_token=JTKYJhcwRisAAAAA:B8b6EyXMami3DlHRoZtv4Kd9OIVDofbU4aQFarQwgh1fkv4T7nI5nE6_S-XqFPrJISyQz-JbdNPHMYBFOONCehaNZa7qToxU8TltrOF3eHj5slooM_ys PDF page 16

- **33** Analysis of 32BJ Member Data. Please see excel spreadsheet entitled "32BJ Security Membership Philadelphia Employee List – 04012025", tab "Pivot", cell C30.
- 34 Economic Policy Institute. Family Budget Calculator. Philadelphia County, PA for a 1 adult, 1 child household. Accessed on April 29, 2025. <u>https://www.epi.org/resources/budget/</u> Total annual cost comes out to \$76,000.
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025.

Question 14: "Summary" tab, cell G108

- 36 Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025. Question 13: "Summary" tab, cell G97
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025. Question 14: "Summary" tab, cell G109
- 38 Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race by Schooling," cell A15.

- 39 Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race by Schooling," cell W25.
- Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025. Question 11: "Summary" tab, cell G78
- **41** Analysis of Philadelphia Security Bargaining Survey Results. See excel doc "2025 Philadelphia Security Contract Survey 0523" Data downloaded on 05/23/2025.

Question 12: "Summary" tab, cells I84 & K83

- **42** Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race Age," cell H15.
- 43 Analysis of Census Data for Top 10 ZIP Codes and Philadelphia County. For each geography, I downloaded and aggregated the following two data set: U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey. Table S1701 Poverty Status Over Last 12 Months for 2022. Accessed on Oct 3, 2024. Sample table: <u>https://data.census.gov/table?q=ZCTA5+19143+S1701</u> See excel doc "Census Analysis of Top Philadelphia Security ZIP Codes" tab "Analysis." Cell G29 gives the average poverty level for the top 10 ZIP codes. Cell G30 gives the poverty level for Philadelphia County.
- **44** Analysis of Census Data for Top 10 ZIP Codes and Philadelphia County. See excel doc "Census Analysis of Top Philadelphia Security ZIP Codes" tab "Analysis." Cell E31 gives the percent of Philly's total population living in these ZIP codes. Cell H31 gives the percentage of Philly's children in poverty living in these ZIP codes.
- **45** Analysis of Census Data for Top 10 ZIP Codes and Philadelphia County. See excel doc "Census Analysis of Top Philadelphia Security ZIP Codes" tab "Analysis." See cell I31.
- **46** Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Black Philly HH Income by Schooling 2," cell K50.
- **47** National Association of Security Companies. WHITE PAPER: Security Officer Training Requirements. Published June 2021. https://www.nasco.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/ NASCO-White-Paper-on-State-Security-Officer-Training-Hour-Requirements-06-21-1.pdf

See pdf page 3: second-last-sentence of the second paragraph entitled unarmed training plus footnote 2.

- **48** Brendan McErlaine. Security Services in the US. Report published by IBISWorld, March 2025. Please see pdf page 6, section entitled "At a Glance."
- **49** Brendan McErlaine. Security Services in the US. Report published by IBISWorld, March 2025. Please see pdf page 6, section entitled "Major Players."
- **50** Brendan McErlaine. Security Services in the US. Report published by IBISWorld, March 2025. Please see pdf page 26, table entitled "Companies"
- 51 Temple University of the Commonwealth System of Higher Education and its Subsidiaries. Consolidated Financial Statements and Supplement Schedules as of and for the Years Ended June 30, 2024 and 2023, and Independent Auditor's Report. https://finance.temple.edu/sites/finance/files/ documents/2024%20Q4%20-%20TU%20Consolidated%20 Report%20(FINAL)%20secured.pdf Please see pdf page 10 entitled "Consolidated Statement of Activities." For FY 2024, Temple's net profit was \$269,900,000 and it's total revenue was \$4,146,214,000.

University of Pennsylvania. Annual Financial Report 2023-2024. <u>https://www.finance.upenn.edu/wp-content/uploads/Penn-Division-of-Finance-FY24-Annual-Report.pdf</u> Please see pdf page 24 entitled "Consolidated Statements of Financial Positions." For FY 2024, U Penn's net profit was \$739,909,000 and total revenue was \$15,791,012,000.

52 Analysis of U.S. Census Bureau Data. American Community Survey, 1-Year Estimates Public Use Microdata Sample for 2023. Please see the excel spreadsheet titled "ACS 2023 -Philly Security Officer Race by Schooling," cell W25.





Securing Our Protectors:

The Case for Improving Standards in Philadelphia's Security Industry

June 2025